

**SAVANNAH HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
STREETCAR HISTORIC DISTRICT
CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS**

HPC DECISION

PETITIONER: **J. ELDER STUDIO, Jerome Elder
30 W. Broughton Street
Savannah, Ga 31401**

FILE NO.: **21-005033-COA**

PROPERTY ADDRESS: **302 EAST VICTORY DRIVE**

PIN: **20075 26001**

ZONING: **TN-2**

STAFF REVIEWER: **Monica Gann**

DATE: **September 22, 2021**

NATURE OF REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting approval for rehabilitation for the property located at 302 East Victory Drive. The work includes window repairs and replacement, door replacement including restoring the transom over the front door, front porches repair including repairing and replacing missing balusters, rebuilding the cornice in wood, stucco repair where needed, new TPO roofing, brick to be cleaned and repointed where needed, and adding a new gutter and downspout system to the building.

The applicant provided interior photos of the windows and does show a one-over-one lite pattern. Windows are proposed to be replaced with “Victorbilt Historic series, wood, double-hung, single pane.” The front door is to be replaced in-kind with “Marvin Ultimate Inswing French Door G2,” white oak painted white. The glass in the door is to be dual pane.

The front porches are proposed to be restored. The porch ceilings are to be repaired and repainted. The balusters are to be restored and any missing balusters are to be reproduced in-kind.

The cornice is to be repaired and replaced in-kind, wood. Above the cornice the stucco is to be cleaned and repaired if needed in-kind, smooth stucco. The brick is proposed to be cleaned and repointed if needed.

A 6” aluminum boxed gutter system and rounded downspout are to be installed, painted black. The roofing material is to be replaced with in-kind, TPO. Additionally, the new coping is to be metal.

New mechanical equipment is to be installed on the roof and new laundry vents are to be installed on the east and west facades and be painted the brick color.

FINDINGS:

The historic building was constructed in 1920 and is a contributing resource within the Thomas Square-Streetcar National Register Historic District and the local Streetcar Historic District.

The following standards from the Preservation Brief 2 - Repointing Mortar Joints in Historic Masonry apply:

***Creating a Repointing Mortar.** In creating a repointing mortar that is compatible with the masonry units, the objective is to achieve one that matches the historic mortar as closely as possible, so that the new material can coexist with the old in a sympathetic, supportive and, if necessary, sacrificial capacity. The exact physical and chemical properties of the historic mortar are not of major significance as long as the new mortar conforms to the following criteria:*

***The new mortar must match the historic mortar in color, texture and tooling.** (If a laboratory analysis is undertaken, it may be possible to match the binder components and their proportions with the historic mortar, if those materials are available.)*

***The sand must match the sand in the historic mortar.** (The color and texture of the new mortar will usually fall into place if the sand is matched successfully.)*

The new mortar must have greater vapor permeability and be softer (measured in compressive strength) than the masonry units.

***The new mortar must be as vapor permeable and as soft or softer (measured in compressive strength) than the historic mortar.** (Softness or hardness is not necessarily an indication of permeability; old, hard lime mortars can still retain high permeability.)*

***Mortar Type and Mix.** Mortars for repointing projects, especially those involving historic buildings, typically are custom mixed in order to ensure the proper physical and visual qualities. These materials can be combined in varying proportions to create a mortar with the desired performance and durability.*

The actual specification of a particular mortar type should take into consideration all of the factors affecting the life of the building including current site conditions, present condition of the masonry, function of the new mortar, degree of weather exposure, and skill of the mason.

Modern materials specified for use in repointing mortar should conform to specifications of the American Society for Testing and Materials (ASTM) or comparable federal specifications, and the resulting mortar should conform to ASTM C 270, Mortar for Unit Masonry.

Five mortar types, each with a corresponding recommended mix, have been established by ASTM to distinguish high strength mortar from soft flexible mortars. The ASTM designated them in decreasing order of approximate general strength as Type M (2,500 psi), Type S (1,800 psi), Type N (750 psi), Type O (350 psi) and Type K (75 psi).

***Type M: Mix: Cement – 1; Hydrated Lime of Lime Putty – ¼; Sand - 3-3¼**
Exterior Use: No longer used*

***Type S: Mix: Cement – 1; Hydrated Lime of Lime Putty – ½; Sand - 4-4½**
Exterior Use: Very durable: granite, hard-cored brick, etc.*

Type N: Mix: Cement – 1; Hydrated Lime of Lime Putty – 1; Sand - 5-6

Exterior Use: Moderately Durable: limestone, durable stone, molded brick
Type O: Mix: Cement – 1; Hydrated Lime Putty – 2; Sand – 8-9
Exterior Use: Minimally Durable: soft hand-made brick
Type K: Mix: Cement – 1; Hydrated Lime Putty – 2; Sand – 8-9
Exterior Use: Minimally Durable: soft hand-made brick
Type L: Mix: Cement – 0; Hydrated Lime Putty – 1; Sand – 2¼-3
Exterior Use: Not for exterior use

The brick is proposed to be cleaned and repointed if needed. Ensure to provide appropriate historic mortar mixture based on the above information that is appropriate for the historic building at 303 East Victory Drive during the repointing of the brick.

Ensure if repointing is necessary a four foot by four-foot test patch of the proposed repointing as it will appear finished (including final finish pointing style and relationship to the brick face) shall be installed in an inconspicuous location on the building and Staff will review.

The following standards from the Preservation Brief 22 - The Preservation and Repair of Historic Stucco apply:

Repairing Deteriorated Stucco. *Historic stucco is inherently not a particularly permanent or long-lasting building material.*

Assessing Damage. *After the cause of deterioration has been identified, any necessary repairs to the building should be made first before repairing the stucco. Such work is likely to include repairs designed to keep excessive water away from the stucco, such as roof, gutter, downspout and flashing repairs, improving drainage, and redirecting rainwater runoff and splash-back away from the building. Horizontal areas such as the tops of parapet walls or chimneys are particularly vulnerable to water infiltration, and may require modifications to their original design, such as the addition of flashing to correct the problem.*

Previous repairs inexpertly carried out may have caused additional deterioration, particularly if executed in portland cement, which tends to be very rigid, and therefore incompatible with early, mostly soft lime-based stucco that is more "flexible." Incompatible repairs, external vibration caused by traffic or construction, or building settlement can also result in cracks which permit the entrance of water and cause the stucco to fail.

Before beginning any stucco repair, an assessment of the stucco should be undertaken to determine the extent of the damage, and how much must be replaced or repaired. Testing should be carried out systematically on all elevations of the building to determine the overall condition of the stucco. Some areas in need of repair will be clearly evidenced by missing sections of stucco or stucco layers. Bulging or cracked areas are obvious places to begin. Unsound, punky or soft areas that have lost their key will echo with a hollow sound when tapped gently with a wooden or acrylic hammer or mallet.

Identifying the Stucco Type. *Analysis of the historic stucco will provide useful information on its primary ingredients and their proportions and will help to ensure that the new replacement stucco will duplicate the old in strength, composition, color and texture as*

closely as possible. However, unless authentic, period restoration is required, it may not be worthwhile, nor in many instances possible, to attempt to duplicate all of the ingredients (particularly some of the additives), in creating the new stucco mortar.

While it is safe to assume that a late-eighteenth or early-nineteenth century stucco is lime-based, late-nineteenth or early-twentieth century stucco may be based on either lime or portland cement. Another important factor to take into consideration is that an early lime-stucco building is likely to have been repaired many times over the ensuing years, and it is probable that at least some of these patches consist of portland cement.

Planning the Repair. *Once the extent of damage has been determined, a number of repair options may be considered. Small hairline cracks usually are not serious and may be sealed with a thin slurry coat consisting of the finish coat ingredients, or even with a coat of paint or whitewash. Commercially available caulking compounds are not suitable materials for patching hairline cracks. Because their consistency and texture is unlike that of stucco, they tend to weather differently, and attract more dirt; as a result, repairs made with caulking compounds may be highly visible, and unsightly. Larger cracks will have to be cut out in preparation for more extensive repair.*

In the interest of saving or preserving as much as possible of the historic stucco, patching rather than wholesale replacement is preferable. When repairing heavily textured surfaces, it is not usually necessary to replace an entire wall section, as the textured finish, if well-executed, tends to conceal patches, and helps them to blend in with the existing stucco. However, because of the nature of smooth-finished stucco, patching a number of small areas scattered over one elevation may not be a successful repair approach unless the stucco has been previously painted, or is to be painted following the repair work. On unpainted stucco such patches are hard to conceal because they may not match exactly or blend in with the rest of the historic stucco surface. For this reason, it is recommended, if possible, that stucco repair be carried out in a contained or well-defined area, or if the stucco is scored, the repair patch should be "squared-off" in such a way as to follow existing scoring. In some cases, especially in a highly visible location, it may be preferable to re-stucco an entire wall section or feature. In this way, any differences between the patched area and the historic surface will not be so readily apparent.

Mixes for Repair of Historic Stucco. *Historic stucco mixes varied a great deal regionally, depending as they did on the availability of local materials. There are probably almost as many mixes that can be used for repair of historic stucco as there are historic stucco buildings. For this reason, it is recommended that at least a rudimentary analysis of the existing historic stucco be carried out in order to determine its general proportions and primary ingredients. However, if this is not possible, or if test results are inconclusive, the following mixes are provided as reference.*

When Total Replacement is Necessary. *Complete replacement of the historic stucco with new stucco of either a traditional or modern mix will probably be necessary only in cases of extreme deterioration-- that is, a loss of bond on over 40-50 percent of the stucco surface. Another reason for total removal might be that the physical and visual integrity of the historic stucco has been so compromised by prior incompatible and ill-conceived repairs that patching would not be successful.*

When stucco no longer exists on a building there is more flexibility in choosing a suitable mix for the replacement. Since compatibility of old and new stucco will not be an issue, the most important factors to consider are durability, color, texture and finish. Depending on the construction and substrate of the building, in some instances it may be acceptable to use a relatively strong cement-based stucco mortar. This is certainly true for many late-nineteenth and early-twentieth century buildings and may even be appropriate to use on some stone substrates even if the original mortar would have been weaker, as long as the historic visual qualities noted above have been replicated. Generally, the best principle to follow for a masonry building is that the stucco mix, whether for repair or replacement of historic stucco, should be somewhat weaker than the masonry to which it is to be applied in order not to damage the substrate.

The proposed work of the stucco includes cleaning and repairing if needed in-kind, smooth stucco. If historic stucco no longer exists, a suitable replacement should be proposed.

The following standards from the Sec 7.11 - Streetcar Historic District Ordinance apply:

Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitation. *Material changes to contributing resources and resources that are eligible for listing as contributing shall be evaluated by use of the current edition of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitation as published by the U.S. Department of the Interior. In considering proposals for alterations to contributing resources, the documented original design of the resource may be considered.*

Secretary of the Interior's Standards 2– Historic Character. *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*

Secretary of the Interior's Standards 4– Historic Changes. *Most properties change over time; those changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.*

Secretary of the Interior's Standards 5– Distinctive Features. *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*

Secretary of the Interior's Standards 6– Deteriorated Features. *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

Secretary of the Interior's Standards 7– Chemical or Physical Treatments. *Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.*

The standards are met. The historic character and historic defining features of the property is to be retained and preserved. Historic features that are deteriorated are to be repaired without any damage to any historic materials through chemical or physical treatments.

Visual Compatibility Criteria. *To maintain the special character of the Streetcar Historic District as identified in the architectural survey and visual analysis, new construction and any material change in appearance shall be consistent with the standards, criteria and guidelines developed for the district. The applicable criteria below shall be used to assess new construction and material changes. These criteria shall not be the basis for appeal to any board, commission or administrator described in this Ordinance, or to the Mayor and Aldermen.*

Materials. *The relationship of materials and textures of the proposed building or structure shall be visually compatible with the contributing buildings and structures to which it is visually related.*

The proposed windows and doors are to be replaced in-kind, wood. The applicant provided interior photos of the windows and does show a one-over-one lite pattern. Windows are proposed to be replaced with “Victorbilt Historic series, wood, double-hung, single pane.” The front door is to be replaced in-kind with “Marvin Ultimate Inswing French Door G2,” white oak painted white. The glass in the door is to be dual pane.

The balusters are to be restored and any missing balusters are to be reproduced in-kind.

The cornice is to be repaired and replaced in-kind, wood. Above the cornice the stucco is to be cleaned and repaired if needed in-kind, smooth stucco.

The roofing material is to be replaced with in-kind, TPO. New coping is to be metal. Additionally, an aluminum boxed gutter system and rounded downspout are to be installed.

All work proposed is visually compatible.

Exterior walls.

The intent of these standards is to ensure that exterior building walls reflect and complement the traditional materials and construction techniques of the district’s architecture.

Alterations to contributing resources.

Exterior walls shall be repaired rather than replaced, provided however, if the degree of degradation does not allow repair, the degradation shall be photographically documented and verified by the Planning Director and the replacement wall shall be of the same materials and configuration as the original wall.

If the original wall material and/or configuration is unknown, the new wall material and configuration shall be based on historic context.

Prohibited Materials: Vinyl siding, aluminum siding, rolled asphalt, precast concrete panels, fiber cement siding, EIFS, and T-111.

The standard is met. The exterior walls are proposed to be repaired where necessary. The brick is to be cleaned and repointed only if needed. The stucco on the parapet is to be repaired with smooth stucco. The cornice is to be repaired and rebuilt in-kind, wood. In addition, aluminum 6” boxed gutter system and 6” rounded downspouts are to be installed.

Windows, Shutters and Storefronts.

The intent of these standards is to ensure that windows, shutters, and storefronts reinforce a sense of rhythm and continuity in architecture and enhance pedestrian activity at the street level.

Windows.

Alterations to contributing resources.

Windows shall be repaired rather than replaced, provided however, if the degree of degradation does not allow repair, the degradation of each window shall be photographically documented and verified by the Planning Director, and the new window shall be of the same materials and configuration as the original (including single-glazed and true-divided lights, when appropriate).

If the original window material and/or configuration is unknown, or if a new window is proposed in an unoriginal opening, the new window material and configuration shall be based on historic context.

The standard is met. The windows are to be replaced due to the significant deterioration of the current windows. The proposed windows replacement is to be “Victorbilt Historic series, wood, double-hung, single pane.” The configuration is not to change.

Doors/Entrances.

The intent of these standards is to ensure that the placement of doors and entrances provides a sense of rhythm and continuity in architecture.

Alterations to contributing resources.

Doors shall be repaired rather than replaced, provided however, if the degree of degradation does not allow repair, the degradation of the door shall be photographically documented and verified by the Planning Director and the new door shall be of the same material and configuration as the original.

If the original door material and/or configuration is unknown, or if a new door is proposed in an unoriginal opening, the new door material and configuration shall be based on historic context.

There shall be a primary entrance along the primary street at intervals no greater than 60 feet.

The standard is met. The front door is to be replaced due to the deterioration. The proposed replacement is to be in-kind with “Marvin Ultimate Inswing French Door G2,” white oak painted white. The glass in the door is to be dual pane. The configuration is not to change.

Porches, Stoops, Balconies and Decks.

Alterations to contributing resources.

Porches shall be repaired rather than replaced, provided however, if the degree of degradation does not allow repair, the degradation shall be photographically documented and verified by the Planning Director,

and the new porch materials and configuration shall be of the same material and configuration as the original.

If the original porch material and/or configuration is unknown, the new porch material and configuration shall be based on historic context.

Front porches shall not be enclosed. Side and rear porches may be enclosed with fine wire mesh, glass or shutters, provided the porch continues to read as a porch and character-defining features (including but not limited to columns, balustrades, entablature, etc.) are retained and not obscured or damaged.

Prohibited materials: Fiberglass (including Perma-Cast), vinyl and PVC.

The standard is met. All front porches are to be restored in-kind. All balusters are to be restored and missing ones are to be reproduced in-kind. Porch ceilings are to be restored in-kind and painted “haint” blue.

Roof.

The intent of these standards is to ensure that roof forms are designed to provide visual interest and coherence in a manner that is consistent with contributing resources.

Contributing Resources.

Materials.

Original roof material shall be repaired rather than replaced, provided however, if the degree of degradation does not allow repair, the degradation shall be photographically documented and verified by the Planning Director, and the new roof shall be of the same material as the original (except wood or asbestos).

Metal roofs shall have a metal drip edge covering all edges.

Configuration.

Original roof configuration shall be maintained.

The standard is met. The roof is to be repaired in-kind with TPO. Mechanical equipment is to be installed on the roof after roof repair. The configuration of the roof is not to change.

Mechanical Equipment and Refuse.

The intent of these standards is to ensure that mechanical equipment and refuse is appropriately sited to provide the least negative visual impact. In addition to the requirements set forth in Sec. 9.5, Screening and Buffers, mechanical equipment and refuse shall comply with the following:

Electrical vaults, meter boxes, communications devices, and satellite dishes shall be located on the secondary or rear façade and shall be minimally visible.

Roof mounted equipment and HVAC units shall be screened from view from the street.

HPC Decision – Petition of J. ELDER STUDIO, Jerome Elder

Address **302 EAST VICTORY DRIVE**

File No. 21-005033-COA

Date September 22, 2021

Page 9

Refuse storage areas for dumpsters and compactors shall be located within a building or to the side of rear of the building and screened from the public right-of-way.

Alternative energy source devices may be permitted on new construction, additions, and alterations to non-contributing resources provided they are integrated into the building design. Alternative energy source devices may be permitted on contributing resources provided they are not visible from the street and do not damage or obscure character-defining features.

The standard is met. The mechanical equipment which includes the HVAC system is to be installed on the roof.

Ensure once the equipment is installed on the roof that it cannot be seen from the public right of way. Otherwise, mechanical equipment screening would need to be installed.

Ensure refuse storage areas for dumpsters and compactors shall be located within a building or to the side of rear of the building and screened from the public right-of-way.

HPC Decision – Petition of J. ELDER STUDIO, Jerome Elder
Address **302 EAST VICTORY DRIVE**
File No. 21-005033-COA
Date September 22, 2021
Page 10

DECISION:

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve for the rehab at property 302 East Victory Drive, with following conditions, to be submitted to staff for review and approval otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Once mechanical equipment is installed on the roof ensure that it cannot be seen from the public right-of-way otherwise mechanical screening is required.
2. Refusal storage must be kept in rear or the side of the building and must be screened off from the public right of way.
3. Ensure if repointing is necessary, to provide appropriate historic mortar mixture for repointing of the brick.
4. Ensure a four foot by four-foot test patch of the proposed repointing, as it will appear finished (including final finish pointing style and relationship to the brick face), is installed in an inconspicuous location on the building and Staff will review.
5. In repairing the stucco, if found that historic stucco no longer exists, a suitable replacement should be proposed.

DocuSigned by:


CP348E3FFC9647D

Virginia Mobley, Chairperson

September 22, 2021

Date



Melanie Wilson, Executive Director
Chatham County-Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission

September 22, 2021

Date



Leah G. Michalak
Director of Historic Preservation

September 22, 2021

Date

This decision will expire on September 22, 2023.

**Petitioner may be required to obtain a building permit and/or encroachment license in addition to Streetcar Historic District approval. Prior to the issuance of the building permit, permit plans must display the Streetcar approval stamp. It is the Petitioner’s responsibility to submit permit plans to the Preservation Staff for stamp prior to submitting for a building permit.

**The Certificate of Appropriateness approval card must be posted at all times during construction in a location next to the building permit and clearly visible to the public.

MW: LGM: mg

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Historic District: Streetcar Historic Distict

File #: 21-005033 Approval Date: 9/22/2021

Address: 302 East Victory Drive

Work Approved:

rehab

Note: This should be posted in a conspicuous location next to the building permit & visible to the public. Remove this sign once the work has been completed.



C H A T H A M C O U N T Y - S A V A N N A H
METROPOLITAN PLANNING COMMISSION

Planning the Future - Respecting the Past

www.thempc.com

110 EAST STATE STREET, P.O. BOX 8246, SAVANNAH GEORGIA 31412 - 8246 PHONE 912-651-1440 FACSMILE 912-651-1480

NEXT STEPS

You have received a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior work within an Historic District ...
what are the next steps?

You may need a building permit.

Contact the City of Savannah Development Services Department at 5515 Abercorn Street (912)-651-6530 to determine if a building permit is required. If a building permit is required, we will need to stamp your permit plans.

Please submit three sets of permit plans to the Historic Preservation Department of the MPC for a stamp. Two sets of plans will be returned to the applicant to include with the building permit application; the third set will be retained for MPC records.

You may also need an encroachment permit.

If your project encroaches into the public right-of-way, you will also need an encroachment permit. Contact the City of Savannah Real Estate Services Department at 1375 Chatham Parkway (912)-651-6524 to determine if an encroachment permit is required.

Please contact the Historic Preservation Department at (912)-651-1440 or historic@thempc.org to schedule an appointment to review and stamp your plans.